Security Analysis of Signal's PQXDH Handshake



Rune Fiedler¹



Felix Günther²

¹Technische Universität Darmstadt, Germany rune.fiedler@cryptoplexity.de

²IBM Research Europe – Zurich, Switzerland mail@felixguenther.info

PKC 2025

Signal: Asynchronous Authenticated Key Exchange



Rune Fiedler (TU Darmstadt)

Security Analysis of Signal's PQXDH Handshake

Signal: Asynchronous Authenticated Key Exchange



Rune Fiedler (TU Darmstadt)

Security Analysis of Signal's PQXDH Handshake

Signal: Asynchronous Authenticated Key Exchange







• session key: $KDF(DH_1 \parallel \ldots \parallel DH_4)$



• session key: $KDF(DH_1 || \dots || DH_4 || ss)$



- session key: $KDF(DH_1 \parallel \ldots \parallel DH_4 \parallel ss)$
- \blacktriangleright reduced session: Bob without ephemeral keys, semi-static KEM $m{Q}$

Analyses of Signal's Initial Handshake(s): X3DH and PQXDH

- ▶ reductionist analysis of X3DH [CCD⁺17] with a [BR94] style key-exchange model
- tool-based analysis of PQXDH with ProVerif and CryptoVerif [BJKS24]
 - (re-)discovered (potential) KEM re-encapsulation attack [CDM24]
 - corruption of long-term keys only
 - reduced mode only (without Bob's ephemeral keys)

Analyses of Signal's Initial Handshake(s): X3DH and PQXDH

- ▶ reductionist analysis of X3DH [CCD⁺17] with a [BR94] style key-exchange model
- tool-based analysis of PQXDH with ProVerif and CryptoVerif [BJKS24]
 - (re-)discovered (potential) KEM re-encapsulation attack [CDM24]
 - corruption of long-term keys only
 - reduced mode only (without Bob's ephemeral keys)

- our work
 - ▶ follows [CCD⁺17, BFG⁺22] but explicitly models signatures (albeit with distinct signing keys)
 - identifies precise requirements of the KEM
 - models maximum-exposure with clean predicates

$$\begin{aligned} \mathsf{Adv}_{\mathsf{PQXDH}}^{\mathsf{KI}}(\mathcal{A}) &\leq \frac{(n_p + n_p \cdot n_{ss} + n_s)^2}{q} + \gamma_{\mathsf{coll}} \cdot (n_p \cdot n_{ss} + n_s) + n_s \cdot \delta_{\mathsf{corr}} + \epsilon_{\mathsf{LEAK}+r} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_p \cdot n_{ss} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}})) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{LT}-\mathsf{SS}} \\ &+ (n_s \cdot n_p \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{LT}} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{ss} \cdot n_s \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}})) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{SS}} \wedge \mathsf{type} = \mathsf{full} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{ss} \cdot n_s \cdot \min(\epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}, \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}}))) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{SS}} \wedge \mathsf{type} = \mathsf{reduced} \\ &+ (n_s^2 \cdot \min(\epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}, \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}})) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{E}} \wedge \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{peerE}} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_s^2 \cdot q_{\mathsf{RO}} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}})) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{E}} \wedge \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{sigE}} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \mathsf{Adv}_{\mathsf{PQXDH}}^{\mathsf{KI}}(\mathcal{A}) &\leq \frac{(n_p + n_p \cdot n_{\mathsf{ss}} + n_s)^2}{q} + \gamma_{\mathsf{coll}} \cdot (n_p \cdot n_{\mathsf{ss}} + n_s) + n_s \cdot \delta_{\mathsf{corr}} + \epsilon_{\mathsf{LEAK}} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_p \cdot n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}})) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{L}-\mathsf{LS}} \\ &+ (n_s \cdot n_p \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{LT}} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot n_s \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}})) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{SS}} \wedge \mathsf{type} = \mathsf{full} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot n_s \cdot \min(\epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}, \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}}))) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{SS}} \wedge \mathsf{type} = \mathsf{reduced} \\ &+ (n_s^2 \cdot \min(\epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}, \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}})) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{E}} \wedge \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{peerE}} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_s^2 \cdot q_{\mathsf{RO}} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}})) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{E}} \wedge \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{sigE}} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \mathsf{Adv}_{\mathsf{PQXDH}}^{\mathsf{KI}}(\mathcal{A}) &\leq \frac{(n_p + n_p \cdot n_{\mathsf{ss}} + n_s)^2}{q} + \gamma_{\mathsf{coll}} \cdot (n_p \cdot n_{\mathsf{ss}} + n_s) + n_s \cdot \delta_{\mathsf{corr}} + \epsilon_{\mathsf{LEAK}+\mathsf{r}} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_p \cdot n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}})) & /\!\!/ \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{L}-\mathsf{LS}} \\ &+ (n_s \cdot n_p \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}) & /\!\!/ \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{LT}} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot n_s \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}})) & /\!\!/ \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{SS}} \wedge \mathsf{type} = \mathsf{full} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot n_s \cdot \min(\epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}, \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}}))) & /\!\!/ \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{SS}} \wedge \mathsf{type} = \mathsf{reduced} \\ &+ (n_s^2 \cdot \min(\epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}, \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}})) & /\!\!/ \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{E}} \wedge \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{peerE}} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_s^2 \cdot q_{\mathsf{RO}} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}})) & /\!\!/ \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{E}} \wedge \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{sigE}} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \mathsf{Adv}_{\mathsf{PQXDH}}^{\mathsf{KI}}(\mathcal{A}) &\leq \frac{(n_p + n_p \cdot n_{ss} + n_s)^2}{q} + \gamma_{\mathsf{coll}} \cdot (n_p \cdot n_{ss} + n_s) + n_s \cdot \delta_{\mathsf{corr}} + \underbrace{\epsilon_{\mathit{LEAK}}}_{\mathsf{CEAK}} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_p \cdot n_{ss} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}})) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{LT}-\mathsf{SS}} \\ &+ (n_s \cdot n_p \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{LT}} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{ss} \cdot n_s \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}})) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{SS}} \wedge \mathsf{type} = \mathsf{full} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{ss} \cdot n_s \cdot \min(\epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}, \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}}))) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{SS}} \wedge \mathsf{type} = \mathsf{reduced} \\ &+ (n_s^2 \cdot \min(\epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}, \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}})) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{E}} \wedge \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{peerE}} \\ &+ (n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_s^2 \cdot q_{\mathsf{RO}} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}})) & // \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{E}} \wedge \operatorname{clean}_{\mathsf{sigE}} \end{aligned}$$

 \blacktriangleright two sessions with same DH public keys, distinct KEM keys \swarrow , both reduced

..., ct

 \blacktriangleright two sessions with same DH public keys, distinct KEM keys $\mathscr{P}\mathscr{P}$, both reduced











- \blacktriangleright \Rightarrow two sessions with same session key: adversary can reveal one and test the other
- proposed protocol fix: session context (KEM public key, ciphertext) in key derivation
- which KEM property needed?

$((\mathsf{pk},\mathsf{sk},r)_1,\ldots,(\mathsf{pk},\mathsf{sk},r)_n)$

$$(\mathsf{pk},\mathsf{sk},r)_1,\ldots,(\mathsf{pk},\mathsf{sk},r)_n$$

$$\downarrow$$

$$(\mathsf{pk}_i,ct_i) \neq (\mathsf{pk}_j,ct_j)$$

LEAK^{+r}-BIND-SS-{CT, PK}









related notion: SH-CR [BJKS24] is incomparable

$$\begin{aligned} \mathsf{Adv}_{\mathsf{PQXDH}}^{\mathsf{KI}}(\mathcal{A}) &\leq \frac{\left(n_p + n_p \cdot n_{\mathsf{ss}} + n_s\right)^2}{q} + \gamma_{\mathsf{coll}} \cdot \left(n_p \cdot n_{\mathsf{ss}} + n_s\right) + n_s \cdot \delta_{\mathsf{corr}} + \frac{\epsilon_{\mathit{LEAK}+r}}{\epsilon_{\mathit{LEAK}+r}} \\ &+ \left(n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_p \cdot n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}})\right) & // \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{L}\mathsf{T}-\mathsf{SS}} \\ &+ \left(n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot n_s \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}})\right) & // \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{SS}} \wedge \mathsf{type} = \mathsf{full} \\ &+ \left(n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot n_s \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}})\right) & // \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{SS}} \wedge \mathsf{type} = \mathsf{full} \\ &+ \left(n_s \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot n_s \cdot \mathsf{min}(\epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}, \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}})\right) & // \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{SS}} \wedge \mathsf{type} = \mathsf{reduced} \\ &+ \left(n_s^2 \cdot \mathsf{min}(\epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}, \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}}\right) & // \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{E}} \wedge \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{perE}} \\ &+ \left(n_p \cdot (\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_s^2 \cdot q_{\mathsf{RO}} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}})\right) & // \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{E}-\mathsf{E}} \wedge \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{sigE}} \end{aligned}$$



Concrete Bound for PQXDH Against Active-Later-Quantum Adversaries

$$\begin{split} \mathsf{Adv}_{\mathsf{PQXDH}}^{\mathsf{KI}}(\mathcal{A}) &\leq \frac{\left(n_p + n_p \cdot n_{\mathsf{ss}} + n_{\mathsf{s}}\right)^2}{q} + \gamma_{\mathsf{coll}} \cdot \left(n_p \cdot n_{\mathsf{ss}} + n_{\mathsf{s}}\right) + n_s \cdot \delta_{\mathsf{corr}} + \epsilon_{\mathsf{LEAK}^{+r}} \\ &+ \left(n_p \cdot \left(\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_p \cdot n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}\right)\right) & // \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{LT}^-\mathsf{SS}} \\ &+ \left(n_p \cdot \left(\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot n_s \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}\right)\right) & // \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{E}^-\mathsf{LT}} \\ &+ \left(n_p \cdot \left(\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot n_s \cdot \epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}\right)\right) & // \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{E}^-\mathsf{SS}} \wedge \mathsf{type} = \mathsf{full} \\ &+ \left(n_p \cdot \left(\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot n_s \cdot \mathbf{n}_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot \mathbf{n}_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot \mathbf{n}_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot \mathbf{n}_{\mathsf{ss}} \cdot \mathsf{corr}\right)\right) & // \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{E}^-\mathsf{SS}} \wedge \mathsf{type} = \mathsf{reduced} \\ &+ \left(n_s^2 \cdot \min(\epsilon_{\mathsf{GDH}}, \epsilon_{\mathsf{CCA}}^{\mathsf{OW}}\right)\right) & // \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{E}^-\mathsf{E}} \wedge \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{peerE}} \\ &+ \left(n_p \cdot \left(\epsilon_{\mathsf{SIG}} + n_s^2 \cdot q_{\mathsf{RO}} \cdot \cdots\right)\right) & // \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{E}^-\mathsf{E}} \wedge \mathsf{clean}_{\mathsf{sigE}} \end{split}$$



Concrete Bound for PQXDH Against Quantum Adversaries



- adding KEM ss to the KDF input achieves hybrid security
- secure against active-now-quantum-later due to signature on ephemeral KEM key
- should add context to KDF (especially KEM pk, ct) [BJKS24]
 - forgo binding assumption on KEM
 - tighter proof
- needed: domain separation on signatures against key confusion attacks
 - DH vs KEM [BJKS24]
 - ephemeral vs semi-static KEM

PQXDH Provides Hybrid Key Indistinguishability



eprint: 2024/702

Rune Fiedler (TU Darmstadt)

Security Analysis of Signal's PQXDH Handshake

PKC 2025

rune.fiedler@cryptoplexity.de

References I

[BFG⁺22] Jacqueline Brendel, Rune Fiedler, Felix Günther, Christian Janson, and Douglas Stebila. Post-quantum asynchronous deniable key exchange and the Signal handshake. In Goichiro Hanaoka, Junji Shikata, and Yohei Watanabe, editors, PKC 2022: 25th International Conference on Theory and Practice of Public Key Cryptography, Part II, volume 13178 of Lecture Notes in Computer Science, pages 3–34, Virtual Event, March 8–11, 2022. Springer, Cham, Switzerland.

[BJKS24] Karthikeyan Bhargavan, Charlie Jacomme, Franziskus Kiefer, and Rolfe Schmidt. Formal verification of the PQXDH post-quantum key agreement protocol for end-to-end secure messaging. In Davide Balzarotti and Wenyuan Xu, editors, USENIX Security 2024: 33rd USENIX Security Symposium, Philadelphia, PA, USA, August 14–16, 2024. USENIX Association.

[BR94] Mihir Bellare and Phillip Rogaway.

Entity authentication and key distribution.

In Douglas R. Stinson, editor, Advances in Cryptology – CRYPTO'93, volume 773 of Lecture Notes in Computer Science, pages 232–249, Santa Barbara, CA, USA, August 22–26, 1994. Springer Berlin Heidelberg, Germany.

[CCD⁺17] Katriel Cohn-Gordon, Cas Cremers, Benjamin Dowling, Luke Garratt, and Douglas Stebila. A formal security analysis of the Signal messaging protocol. In 2017 IEEE European Symposium on Security and Privacy, pages 451–466, Paris, France, April 26–28, 2017. IEEE Computer Society Press.

[CDM24] Cas Cremers, Alexander Dax, and Niklas Medinger.

Keeping up with the KEMs: Stronger security notions for KEMs and automated analysis of KEM-based protocols.

In Bo Luo, Xiaojing Liao, Jun Xu, Engin Kirda, and David Lie, editors, *ACM CCS 2024: 31st Conference on Computer and Communications Security*, pages 1046–1060, Salt Lake City, UT, USA, October 14–18, 2024. ACM Press.

- server icon by Alexiuz AS
- public key icon by Yannick Lung
- (KEM) secret key icon by Yannick Lung
- Signal, the Signal logo, and all related names, designs, and slogans are registered trademarks of Signal Technology Foundation.

long-term

long-term (use forever) semi-static (use for a week) ephemeral (use once)

ephemeral

long-term

ephemeral

8

long-term (use forever) semi-static (use for a week) ephemeral (use once)

 authenticate long-term public keys via safety number (hash of both long-term public keys)

Verify safety number 4 Ľ Tap to scan 04438

04438 04438 04438 04438 04438 04438 04438 04438

To verify end-to-end encryption with , compare the numbers above with their device. You can also scan the code on their device. Learn more

pre-key bundle



Bob uploads semi-static key, signature, and ephemeral keys to key server

pre-key bundle



- Bob uploads semi-static key, signature, and ephemeral keys to key server
- ▶ all key pairs are DH
- Iong-term keys additionally for a signature scheme